

less precious than Cataudella's, less surprised than Giangrande's.

Perhaps *Λυσανίη*, σὺ δὲ ναίχι καλὸς καλός—ἀλλὰ πρὶν εἰπεῖν / τοῦτο σαφώς, Ἥχῳ φησι· “τίς ἄλλος ἔχει;” Before Callimachus can say clearly that he loves Lysanies,⁹ Echo asks if the boy has another lover.¹⁰ Her question echoes the question which Callimachus will have asked himself even as he said, “I love

you” (“Who else is his lover?”).¹¹ It reveals his true feelings for Lysanies. That they were scornful, that his “I love you” was ironic, that he considered the beautiful boy a typical *περίφοιτος ἐρώμενος*, would be more than a fair guess.

ARCHIBALD ALLEN

PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY

9. Σὺ δὲ ναίχι καλὸς καλός = ἐρώ σου. Cf. Giangrande, pp. 35–36.

10. For Callimachus' use of *φάναι* with a direct question, cf. *Hymn* 5. 79–82 (προσέφασεν Ἀθάναι / “τίς . . . / . . . δαίμων;” / ἃ μὲν ἔφα . . .). Cf. also *Hymn* 6. 41 (εἶπε . . . “τίς . . . κόπτει;”). The proposed reading understands *με* as subject of *εἰπεῖν*. For the ellipse, see K. J. McKay (*CR*, N.S. XIX [1969], 143), against Wilkinson, *op. cit.* (n. 4), who suggested

that *μ'* may have dropped out after *σαφώς*. If *σαφώς εἰπεῖν* could mean “to echo,” this punctuation might be preferable: τοῦτο σαφώς Ἥχῳ, φησι “τίς ἄλλος ἔχει;” Before she echoes the words of love, Echo wants to know if the boy is a *περίφοιτος ἐρώμενος*.

11. Word play, between *ναίχι καλός* and *ἄλλος ἔχει*, is still possible, but will be the cynical lover's word play rather than Echo's.

A GODDESS IN CATULLUS (25. 5)

idemque, Thalle, turbida rapacior procella,
5 cum diva †mulier aries† ostendit oscitantes

So Sir Roger Mynors' Oxford text (revised impression, 1967). To the host of conjectures,¹ L. A. MacKay added *Murcia arbitros*,² and that is what K. Quinn printed in the most recent, complete edition of the poems.³ *Murcia*, goddess of sloth and inactivity, will be the soft and languid Thallus' patron, alerting him to the chance of quick thefts when possible witnesses are drowsy and inattentive. But it is surely a bit odd that the goddess of laziness should prompt her lazy devotee to the energetic activity suggested by *turbida rapacior procella*.

Read “cum diva mollior, Quies, ostendit oscitantes.” Thallus is “mollior cuniculi capillo / vel anseris medullula vel imula oricilla / vel pene laguido senis situque araneoso” (1–3). But when quiet descends on a dinner party, when Quies, a goddess softer even than Thallus, shows by her presence that

host and guests are sleepy, Thallus becomes *turbida rapacior procella* and snatches their belongings.⁴

Corruption might be accounted for as follows. *MOLLIORQVIES* was copied as *MOLLIORES*, by simple lipography. *MOLLIORES* then was seen to be inadequate, inviting emendation. Blame was placed on *mollior* (1) which commands the first three lines, and an appropriate substantive adjective was sought to replace *MOLLIORES*. A bright scribe, appreciating Thallus' sexual preferences and dislikes, thought of *MULIERARIOS*, and that entered the archetype as *MULIERARIES*, canonized for us in O, and glossed probably by X's scribe as *MULIER ALIOS AL. AVES*.⁵

ARCHIBALD ALLEN

PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY

1. See, conveniently, J. Granarolo, *REA*, LX (1958), 290–306.

2. *CP*, LXI (1966), 110–11, after M. C. J. Putnam's *Murcia aridos* (*CP*, LIX [1964], 268–70) after H. A. J. Munro's *Murcia atrieis* (*Criticisms and Elucidations of Catullus*, pp. 63–65).

3. *Catullus: The Poems* (London, 1970).

4. On the goddess Quies, cf. Liv. 4. 41. 8 (“iam consul . . . ad fanum Quietis erat”), Stat. *Theb.* 10. 89 (“opaca Quies et pigra Oblivio”), and W. Eisenhut, *s.v.* “Quies (1),” *RE*,

XXIV (1963), 877 ff. For the ellipse of *conivae* or *homines* or some such noun before *oscitantes*, cf. especially 12. 3 (*rollis lintea neglegentiorum*). Catullus does not state explicitly that Thallus steals at a dinner party—hence MacKay's deliberately vague *arbitros*—but he has stolen a *sudarium Saetabum* (7), and so had Asinius (12. 11 ff.), in *ioco atque vino* (12. 2).

5. Cf. Mynors' critical note: “mulier aries O, mulier alios al. aves vel aries G, mulier aves al. aries vel alios R.” Haupt emended *mulier aries* to *mulierarios*.